

Winter 1998

Framing and Ideology: A Comparative Analysis of U.S. and Chinese Newspaper Coverage of the Fourth United Nations Conference on Women and the NGO Forum

Roya Akhavan-Majid

St. Cloud State University, rakhavan@stcloudstate.edu

Jyotika Ramaprasad

Southern Illinois University Carbondale

Follow this and additional works at: https://repository.stcloudstate.edu/comm_facpubs



Part of the [Journalism Studies Commons](#), and the [Mass Communication Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Akhavan-Majid, Roya and Ramaprasad, Jyotika, "Framing and Ideology: A Comparative Analysis of U.S. and Chinese Newspaper Coverage of the Fourth United Nations Conference on Women and the NGO Forum" (1998). *Mass Communication Faculty Publications*. 9.

https://repository.stcloudstate.edu/comm_facpubs/9

This Peer Reviewed Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Mass Communications at theRepository at St. Cloud State. It has been accepted for inclusion in Mass Communication Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of theRepository at St. Cloud State. For more information, please contact rswexelbaum@stcloudstate.edu.

Framing and Ideology: A Comparative Analysis of U.S. and Chinese Newspaper Coverage of the Fourth United Nations Conference on Women and the NGO Forum

Roya Akhavan-Majid

*School of Journalism and Mass Communication
University of Minnesota*

Jyotika Ramaprasad

*College of Mass Communication and Media Arts
Southern Illinois University at Carbondale*

In this study, we examined framing in the U.S. and Chinese press coverage of the Fourth United Nations Conference on Women and the Non-Governmental Organizations Forum in Beijing in 1995. This study had 2 objectives: (a) to systematically assess the coverage of this global feminist event and the extent to which its critical areas of concern were communicated to the public, and (b) to illuminate the dynamics of framing in a comparative context and contribute to its further theoretical development. Employing quantitative and qualitative methods, this study found evidence of the operation of an anticommunist and an antifeminist frame in the U.S. coverage. Under the influence of dominant ideology, the U.S. coverage of the conference focused considerably on an extended criticism of China as a communist nation. The goals of the global feminist movement and their critical areas of concern appeared to hold far less immediacy and salience for the U.S. press than the need to assert dominant U.S. values. On the other hand, under the influence of communist ideology, the Chinese coverage reflected a proequality frame and a strong focus on the critical issues of concern to the global feminist movement. Despite the existence of a propagan-

distic emphasis on the country's extensive preparations as conference host as well as efforts to defend against Western criticism, nationalistic praise for China was far more subtle than originally expected.

Among the few certainties produced by six decades of research in mass communication is the dictum that "news is a socially created product, not a reflection of an objective reality" (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996, p. 21). As a socially constructed product, news is influenced by a host of political, economic, and ideological factors, and open to a fascinating process of cognitive simplification called *framing*.

At the most basic level, news frames are cognitive schemata. Journalists commonly work with news frames to "simplify, prioritize, and structure the narrative flow of events" (Norris, 1995, p. 357). Framing constitutes an inevitable step in the process of news production. It is the stage at which journalists define problems, diagnose causes, and make moral judgments. News frames, however, are embodied, not in overt evaluative statements but rather, in "key words, metaphors, concepts, symbols, and visual images emphasized in a news narrative" (Entman, 1991, p. 7).

In the process of framing social and political issues, the news media can play a powerful role in determining the success or failure of social movements. Rarely does a social movement aimed at changing the status quo escape the transformation in its message that accompanies its efforts to communicate with the public through the news media.

One of the major social movements of this century struggling for access to the mainstream media has been the global feminist movement. Having generally experienced either sensationalized or marginal coverage, the feminist movement has looked to major international events, such as the United Nations (UN) sponsored conferences on women, to raise global consciousness about the critical issues of concern facing women around the world.

Against this backdrop, the purpose of this article is to explore the operation of framing in the U.S. and Chinese coverage of the Fourth UN Conference on Women and the Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO) Forum in Beijing in 1995. This study had two objectives: (a) to systematically assess the coverage of this global feminist event and the extent to which its critical areas of concern were communicated to the public, and (b) to illuminate the dynamics of framing in a comparative context and contribute to its further theoretical development.

FRAMING: A DEFINITION

The concept of framing may be traced back to Goffman (1974), who defined frames as embodiments of "the principles of organization which govern [social] events" (p. 10). Based on this definition, all forms of human experience and their documentation (as in news production) are subject to framing.

The applicability of the framing process to news work was first established by Tuchman (1978) in *Making News*, and has since been developed by other researchers through a number of empirical studies and theoretical contributions. Entman's (1993) extensive work on the concept has produced the following definition of framing in the news:

Frames define problems—determine what a causal agent is doing with what costs and benefits, usually measured in terms of common cultural values; diagnose causes—identify the forces creating the problem; make moral judgments—evaluate causal agents and their effects; and suggest remedies—offer and justify treatments for the problems and predict their likely effects. (p. 52)

The highly interpretive and value-laden process of framing is often based not on individual values but rather, on an invocation of socially created collective universals and traditional understandings to define and interpret new issues at hand. As such, frames frequently draw on and reinforce commonly held stereotypes. As Norris (1995) put it,

News frames bundle key concepts, stock phrases, and stereotyped images to reinforce certain common ways of interpreting developments. The essence of framing is selection to prioritize some facts, events, or developments over others, thereby promoting a particular interpretation New developments are understood within regular patterns. Frames represent stereotypes, which slot particular events into broader interpretive categories that may or may not be appropriate. (p. 358)

Despite the important contributions made by these and other authors to the development of the concept, a major question—that of the connection between news frames and ideology—has remained largely unexplored in the literature.

Close examination of the concepts of news frame and ideology reveals a clear connection between the two concepts. According to Entman (1993), a frame defines problems, diagnoses causes, and offers remedies. This conceptualization is extended by Norris (1995), who defined a news frame as “an interpretive structure that sets particular events within a broader context” (p. 358). The definition of ideology offered by Becker (1984) reflects a close conceptual similarity to the framing definitions: “An ideology is an integrated set of frames of reference through which each of us sees the world and to which all of us adjust our actions” (p. 69). Similarly, Hall (1986) defined ideology as “the mental frameworks—the languages, the concepts, categories, imagery of thought, and the systems of representation—which different classes and social groups deploy in order to make sense of, define, figure out, and render intelligible the way society works” (p. 29). It may be argued that the frames of reference discussed by Becker and the mental frameworks defined by Hall are the same interpretive structures Norris referred to. Both frames and ideolo-

gies provide the people in a given society with a framework within which to interpret events, define problems, diagnose causes, and seek remedies. Based on the foregoing discussion, it is the contention of this article that ideology is a major source of framing in the news and framing is an important mechanism by which ideology is transmitted through the news.

IDEOLOGICAL INFLUENCES ON FRAMING OF NEWS

Three types of ideology may be expected to exert primary influence on the framing of news: dominant ideology, elite ideology, and journalistic ideology, or occupational ideology (Becker, 1984, p. 73; Murdock & Golding, 1977, p. 35; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996, p. 243).

Dominant ideology, in this context, refers to views and ideas shared by the majority of people in a given society. Within U.S. society, capitalism, anticommunism, and male worldviews and values may be considered as pertinent examples of dominant ideology. Communism and its precepts, on the other hand, provide examples of dominant ideology within the Chinese society. (Although male worldviews remain dominant in China, the influence of the Chinese patriarchy is tempered by the strong prowomen's equality rhetoric that has long comprised a major element of the Communist Party ideology.)

Elite ideology, on the other hand, may be defined as the particular ideology or policy orientation on the part of the government or the administration in power at any given point in time. In most cases, elite ideology coincides with the dominant ideology. There are, however, occasions when the policy interests of a given administration may vary from the dominant ideology (M. Wang, 1991). In general, research has shown that, when the elite ideology differs from the dominant ideology, the elite ideology tends to prevail as the primary influence on framing in the news. Such occasional separations between the dominant and elite ideologies may be expected to occur in both China and the United States. China's continuing strong adherence to a Communist Party platform, however, makes such a variation less likely.

Arising primarily from media routines and occupational values, journalistic ideology provides another major source of influence on the framing of news. Examples of journalistic ideology within the United States include emphasis on events, not issues; emphasis on the unusual and deviant; and focus on elite sources and actors. In many ways, the journalistic ideology tends to reinforce the elite ideology in the United States, not only by being subject to manipulation by elites but also through keeping out access by, and trivialization of, other less powerful groups in society.

Despite gradual changes in the Chinese mass media orientation and structure during the last decade, the journalistic ideology in China continues to remain

closely wedded to the dominant ideology with respect to the role of the press in a communist society. A strong issue orientation in reporting and an emphasis on ideological indoctrination of the masses continue to constitute primary examples of journalistic ideology in China.

All three types of ideology may be expected to function as sources of framing in the U.S. and Chinese coverage of the Fourth UN Conference on Women and the NGO Forum in Beijing.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The general influence of ideology on news content is documented extensively within the mass communication literature. The review of literature in this study, therefore, focuses specifically on identifying the relevant frames and ideologies that may be expected to shape the U.S. and Chinese newspaper coverage of the UN Women's Conference and NGO Forum in Beijing.

United States

Among the major frames arising from the dominant ideology in the United States and relevant to the coverage of the conference is the China frame. During the last four decades, the People's Republic of China has been a major focus of U.S. foreign policy and has received substantial coverage by U.S. newspapers. Research on the U.S. newspaper coverage of China has shown the presence of a clear China frame, which has been modified occasionally to fit changes in the elite ideology.

In general, newspaper coverage of China has reflected the dominant capitalist ideology within the United States. As Kobland, Du, and Kwan (1992) pointed out, the predominant frame in covering China has been that of "anti-communism" (p. 64). The "deceitfulness of communists" has been a common narrative in the U.S. media, and coverage about communist states has "almost entirely focused on the problems and failures of Marxist governments" (p. 66).

Evidence of the influence of this anticommunist frame on the news is found in a study by Entman (1991) comparing the U.S. media coverage of the Korean Air Lines and Iran Air incidents (passenger planes shot down by a Soviet fighter plane in 1983, and by a U.S. Navy ship in 1988, respectively). The study found that in the case of the downing of the Korean passenger plane by the Soviets, the frame emphasized the moral bankruptcy and guilt of the communist nation perpetrating the act, whereas in covering the downing of the Iranian plane by the United States, the frame deemphasized guilt and focused on the complex problems of operating military technology. In the same vein, a study of the coverage of student demonstrations in South Korea in 1980 and in China in 1989 by Kobland et al. (1992) found sharp

contrasts in the framing of the two incidents, despite their clear similarities. In covering the demonstrations in Korea, they found that *The New York Times* portrayed the government actions as an understandable response to the threat imposed by the demonstrators' "rebellious insurrection." The reporting of the demonstrations at Beijing's Tiananmen Square, on the other hand, emphasized "the legitimacy of the demonstrator's goals and the efficacy of their means, while describing the government as cruelly repressive" (p. 72).

Although the anticommunist frame in newspaper coverage has persisted throughout the last few decades, the coverage of China did go through a brief period of deviation from the dominant ideology around the time of President Richard Nixon's visit to China. In a study of the use of ideological symbols (e.g., "Red China") versus geographical symbols (e.g., People's Republic of China) in *The New York Times*, Chang (1988) found a drastic decrease in the *Times's* use of ideological symbols in 1971, when President Nixon announced that he would visit China. The elite policy to begin the process of Sino-American normalization thus introduced a variation on the anticommunist theme of the dominant ideology. In addition to reflecting the influence of ideology in framing, the results of this study provide evidence of the primacy of the elite ideology over dominant ideology. These findings were further confirmed in a study by M. Wang (1991), who compared *The New York Times's* coverage of China during Nixon's trip with that during the Tiananmen Square demonstrations. The study found that during Nixon's trip, China was depicted as a "good socialist country that was vested with cultural heritage and historical sites" (p. 61). The student demonstrations, however, marked a return to the dominant anticommunist frame, "emphasizing the confrontation between pro-democratic, pro-change college students and the corrupt, incompetent, and unyielding communist regime" (p. 59).

Since the Tiananmen Square incident, the anticommunist ideology has, once again, characterized the coverage of China by U.S. newspapers. At the time the UN Women's Conference and NGO Forum were held in Beijing, the elite policy toward China did not in any way compete with the dominant ideology. Rather, it presented a close match with the traditional anticommunist theme. It was expected in this study, therefore, that the dominant anticommunist ideology would continue to exert an influence on the U.S. newspaper coverage of the UN Women's Conference and NGO Forum in China.

Aside from the China frame arising from the confluence of the dominant and elite ideologies and reinforced by the U.S. journalistic propensity for emphasizing conflict, the "feminism frame" presented another source of potential influence on the coverage of the UN Women's Conference.

Previous studies of media coverage of women's issues and the feminist movement in the United States lend clear support to the argument that the underlying structure of mainstream U.S. media content is, generally, oppressive of women (Hall, 1982). The oppression and devaluation of women takes a variety of forms in

the media, including marginalization and trivialization of feminist issues within the news content.

As Tuchman (1978) pointed out, from the outset, the women's movement was beset by an excess of mirth on the part of male editors who "simply refused to take seriously 'Women's lib,' to use the slighting nickname conferred by the media" (p. 190). Since the early 1970s, coverage of women's issues has been characterized by a consistent level of ridicule and ostracism in the media. As Creedon (1993) pointed out, within the mainstream press, feminists have been consistently framed as "deviant sexually, a bunch of man-haters out to destroy 'family values'" (p. 66).

In general, the images and portrayals of women in the media have advocated a position of inferiority for women in society. In *Women and the Media*, Butler and Paisley (1980) concluded from a wide range of studies of portrayals of women in the media that, in the majority of the cases, the message being communicated about women was either "put her down" or "keep her in her place" (p. 167).

To the extent that the feminist movement has succeeded in securing certain rights and freedoms for women, it has come to face a strong backlash from the traditional patriarchal society, whose ideological outlook on feminism has continued to be reflected in several new antifeminist themes within the media. Among these themes are women appearing as unfeminine, women in conflict with each other, career-oriented women causing the breakdown of family, and women portrayed as suffering the fallout of feminism, without relationships or children, or under the pressure of managing both career and family (Danner & Walsh, 1996; Faludi, 1991). A recent qualitative study by Danner and Walsh (1996) of *The New York Times's* and *The Washington Post's* stories on the Fourth UN Conference on Women found evidence of the presence of such backlash themes in the coverage. According to the authors, the Conference attendees were portrayed as radical feminists and bickering women whose boisterous efforts had little chance of succeeding.

Interestingly, the professional ideology of journalists has also been largely responsible for reinforcing the feminism frame. As Tuchman (1978) and Fishman (1977) demonstrated, the news media's constant need to fill the news hole quickly and conveniently with a steady diet of big stories based on quotes from "official sources" who help journalists appear objective and credible in the process has resulted in a professional mode of operation that serves to perpetuate the power of legitimated institutions. Lacking both the credibility afforded by official sources and the concreteness inherent in official events, the consciousness-raising efforts of social movements are generally ignored by the mass media.

It must be pointed out that this discussion is not meant to deny the important role that certain media, journalists, or news stories have historically been able to play in advancing the cause of equal rights for women. And we cannot ignore the fact that the women's movement has, on occasion, actually benefited from the tendency on the part of the mainstream press to give prominent coverage to elite sources and legitimized institutions (e.g., the Supreme Court) who have made legal and policy

pronouncement favorable to the rights of women (e.g., reproductive rights and affirmative action). Yet, it remains true that, except for the occasional efforts of individual journalists, the mainstream media have tended to act as agents of social change only after that change is already legitimized by other established elite social institutions (Olien, Tichenor, & Donohue, 1989).

Because of their preference for official rather than grass-roots sources; focus on events, not issues; and routine search for stories with concrete dramatic elements, the news media have tended to ignore women's issues, except when an extreme act, controversial event, or elite pronouncement has helped propel the movement into the media spotlight.

Thus the journalistic ideology, characterized by a primary focus on legitimized institutions and elite sources; an emphasis on the deviant, negative, and dramatic; and an inability to delve deeply into social issues, is expected to contribute to the feminism frame in the U.S. newspaper coverage of the UN Conference on Women.

China

Despite China's recent moves toward market reform, the country's political system has remained largely intact and operates under the continuing influence of communist ideology, which was expected to exercise visible influence on the news coverage. Specifically, the Communist Party's strong ideological emphasis on gender equality was expected to provide a primary source of influence on the framing of the news about the Conference.

Among the major principles of Marxist thought vigorously promoted by Mao Tse Tung was the idea that "the degree of woman's emancipation is the natural measure of the general emancipation" (Z. Wang, 1996, p. 193). During the revolutionary period, the women's movement in China was conceived as an integral part of the country's Communist Revolution. The Communist Party's official line since 1949 has been actively proequality for women, particularly in the economic and political arenas (Croll, 1983).

Despite the difficulties of implementing this policy within the ultratriarchal and ultratraditional Chinese society, visible changes have indeed occurred in the status of Chinese women since the Communist Revolution (Croll, 1983). Furthermore, since early in the days of the Maoist Revolution, these changes have been touted as having enabled Chinese women to enjoy a much higher level of equality with men than their Western counterparts (*The Situation of Chinese Women*, 1994; Yunhu, 1995; Z. Wang, 1996). In pursuing its bid for hosting the UN Conference, one of the major policy objectives of the Chinese government—its elite ideology—was to use the Conference as a means of improving its international image by showcasing China's commitment to the cause of equal rights for women (Z. Wang, 1996).

Thus, based on the confluence of both the dominant communist and elite ideologies in China, a strong "proequality" frame was expected in the Chinese newspaper

coverage of the Conference and NGO Forum. At the same time, given the continuing influence of the traditional gender discourse in the lives of Chinese women, certain elements of the traditional image associated with women, particularly those relating to the ideals of womanly virtue, were also expected to emerge in the news frames.

For centuries, Confucianism has been the dominant influence on Chinese gender discourse. In the context of the strict age- and gender-based hierarchical relationships of the Confucian social order, women were subject to the authority of male figures in their family (father, husband, eldest son) throughout their lives (Bauer, Feng, Riley, & Zhao, 1992). The Confucian patriarchy was based, in part, on a belief in the moral inferiority of women. Neo-Confucianism continued to hold women as morally inferior to men but, paradoxically, demanded that they live by higher moral standards than those expected of men (Li, 1991). A "virtuous woman" rhetoric thus became an integral part of the Chinese traditional gender discourse, with the highest virtue expected of women being that of self-sacrifice.

As Knapp (1992) pointed out, "From the early teens, a girl would learn to be a 'womanly woman,' modest, chaste, passive, submissive" (p. vii). Pan Chao, a poet, historian, and moralist of the Han dynasty, held four characteristics to be essential for women: "womanly virtue, womanly words, womanly bearing, womanly work" (Li, 1991, p. 25). Elaborating on this theme, she wrote, "a virtuous woman should be obedient, quiet, self-effacing, and ignorant, devoting herself only to the service of the family" (Li, 1991, p. 25).

Despite the growing participation of women in the economic and political life of China, "the fundamental and traditionally accepted place of women in relation to the family, marriage, and sexuality has hardly changed" (Thakur, 1997, p. 189). Since the days of the Communist Revolution, virtuous self-sacrifice has continued to be demanded of women, not only for the family but also for the nation and the cause of communism. Such a career of service to the country, however, is to be pursued in conjunction with, not at the expense of, service to the family. This lingering cultural attitude is deeply internalized by Chinese women themselves. The following description of an interview with a female Chinese deputy mayor published in *Beijing Review* reveals the continuing influence of this attitude among contemporary Chinese women: "Tao Ruiying said she never brings her mayoral role into her family. She has always supported her husband, a teacher, in his career and never asked him to make any sacrifices for her" (Huang, 1993, p. 28).

A related strand in the Chinese gender discourse is the image of peacefulness associated with the virtuous woman. Along with the traditional emphasis on self-sacrifice for women, such images of peacefulness and cooperation have continued to coexist within the proequality rhetoric of the communist era.

Thus, the virtuous woman image, arising from coexisting tendencies within both the traditional and postcommunist ideologies, was expected to serve as another source of potential influence on the framing of the news on the UN Conference and NGO Forum.

Finally, the Chinese journalistic ideology was expected to lend itself to reinforcing the dominant and elite proequality frame, not only because of its lingering propaganda function, but also its continuing emphasis on social and ideological issues in news coverage.

It is important to note, however, that despite the continuing influence of the Communist Party on the Chinese media, the process of ideological transmission from the government to the media in China can no longer be viewed purely from a propaganda model perspective.

Since the Communist Revolution, the shaping of the news by the dominant communist ideology in China has been viewed as a direct process of ideological control, within which the news media are expected to operate as "the throat and tongue" of the Party (Zhao & MacShane, 1994, p. 31). During the last decade, however, China's cautious moves toward a market economy have led to major changes in the Chinese media landscape, including a visible growth in the number of commercially supported regional media outlets, the appearance of a variety of "yellow" tabloids, greater variety in the international news, livelier and on occasion more critical content, and a general toning down of the heavily ideological discourse that characterized news content in the past (Tempest, 1996; J. Wang & Chang, 1996; Zhao & MacShane, 1994).

Based on a study of the content of five regional newspapers before and after the Tiananmen Square crackdown, Chang, Chen, and Zhang (1993) concluded that the Chinese media can no longer be viewed as "parrots of the Communist Party" (p. 176). An analysis of the news content of China's Central Television National Network and *People's Daily* newspaper by Chang, Wang, and Chen (1994), furthermore, found increasing relevance for the use of a social construction of reality model in explaining the process of ideological transmission from the Party to the Chinese media. The news in China, the authors asserted, is "qualitatively designed to put social reality into perspective within the Chinese context. Internally, it stresses the government's current commitment to and practices of economic reform and social restructuring" (p. 66). In another study of Chinese television programming and foreign imports, J. Wang and Chang (1996) found that in recent years, the mass media in China have become "less of a class ideologue and more of a state manager" (p. 197), reflecting the pragmatic policy objectives of the government within an increasingly decentralized mass media system.

These studies provide evidence of a gradual loosening of the tight grip of government control on the Chinese media, also showing how the official party line continues to shape the views expressed by the major news outlets in China. Thus, although the process of ideological transmission may have become less direct, the Chinese mass media continue to remain major vehicles for the promotion of Party policy and the achievement of social, economic, and political goals of the government. As Chang et al. (1994) pointed out, "In essence, the news in China provides

Chinese society with the basic knowledge needed for the building of a forced consensus, the basis of Communist rule and legitimacy" (p. 66).

In addition to the continuing government influence, the maintenance of a strong Party character by the news media remains a cornerstone of journalistic training and ideology in China (Gan, 1994). Although calling for a move away from dull ideological content and "olds and black-out" in the news toward greater richness in information and factual content, many of the country's journalism educators and intellectuals continue to stress the guidance role of the media, expressing great discontent over the recent manifestations of sensationalistic influence from the Western media (Gan, 1994).

Thus, it was expected that the current Chinese journalistic ideology would lead to a coverage that, although not heavily and directly propagandistic, would help to uphold a positive image of the government and support the government's efforts to present itself to the outside world as a praiseworthy Conference host.

METHOD

The study combined a quantitative content analysis with a qualitative assessment of the overall frames in the news and editorial content of seven U.S. daily newspapers and one Chinese newspaper. The U.S. newspapers consisted of *The New York Times*, *The Washington Post*, *The Wall Street Journal*, *The Los Angeles Times*, the *Chicago Tribune*, the *Atlanta Journal-Constitution*, and the *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*,¹ selected on the basis of their geographic dispersion and their importance as national agenda setters. The Chinese newspaper selected for study was the English language *China Daily* (circulation of 300,000), which provided access to English language news coverage of the Conference and the NGO Forum. According to Stevenson (1994), *China Daily* belongs to a group of international English language newspapers that are "part of governments' efforts to reach an international audience" (p. 156). Like many other newspapers of its kind, *China Daily* operates "under the same rules as the local language press and allows outsiders a

¹All the newspapers included in the study have large circulations and, generally, exert an important trickle-down effect on the content of smaller newspapers and other media. They are also resource rich and are able to provide international news for readers. *The New York Times* and *The Washington Post* have been ranked among the world's elite or prestige papers (Barranco & Shyles, 1988; Stempel & Windhauser, 1984), are read by U.S. leaders (Weiss, 1974), and serve as a reference index for other media (Breed, 1955; Chang, 1988). These and other sample newspapers publish large amounts of foreign news (Haque, 1983; Riffe, 1984). Daily circulations of these newspapers are as follows: *The New York Times*, 1,081,541; *The Washington Post*, 793,660; *The Wall Street Journal*, 1,763,140; the *Los Angeles Times*, 1,012,189; the *Chicago Tribune*, 684,366; the *Atlanta Journal-Constitution*, 520,880; the *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, 319,990 (International Year Book, 1996).

glimpse of the country and its perspective on the world" (p. 156). Thus, as a convenience sample of the Chinese coverage, *China Daily* provided reliable access to the overall approach taken by the Chinese press to covering the UN Conference and the NGO Forum. In the course of the two events, the *China Daily* devoted a special supplement titled "World Women" to their coverage each day. All of the articles covering the Conference and the NGO forum appeared in this special supplement.

In the case of the U.S. newspapers, the entire population of the news and editorial material covering the UN Conference on Women and the NGO Forum between August 11 and September 21, 1995 (both dates inclusive) was studied. These dates were selected to include newspaper coverage a few days before and a few days after the two events.² In the case of the *China Daily*, the entire population of the stories contained in the daily supplement during the 2-week period between August 30 and September 15 was studied.³

The stories in the U.S. press were located through the respective indexes of the newspapers. Titles relevant to the Conference and Forum were checked in the indexes. Once the appropriate title(s) were located in each index, all relevant stories under the title(s) were selected.⁴

In the case of the *China Daily* coverage, two coders independently reviewed all issues of the special supplement and located the relevant stories.

This procedure yielded a total of 114 stories and 1,957 relevant paragraphs for the U.S. sample and 215 stories and 2,073 paragraphs for the Chinese sample. A total of 329 stories and 4,030 paragraphs were thus analyzed for the study.

To assess the fit between the reality of the conference and the coverage given to it in the press, the agendas of the two events and their issues of concern needed to be examined independently of the news coverage. Two extramedia documents—the *Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action* and the *NGO Forum on Women: Schedule of Activities*—provided the basis for such an assessment. The *Beijing Declaration* reflects the major areas of concern for participants of this Conference and is a declaration of their agenda for action. It is organized around 12 interrelated and interdependent critical areas of concern for women that need urgent action: poverty, education and training, health, violence, armed conflict, economic issues, power and decision making, institutional mechanisms for advancement, human

²The United Nations Conference on Women began on September 4 and ended on September 15, 1995. The NGO Forum ran concurrently with the Conference for part of the time, starting on August 30 and ending on September 8, 1995.

³The September 10 issue of "World Women" was missing from the convenience sample available to us and despite several attempts we were unable to locate it.

⁴For both countries, a final check of the sample was done in the following manner. Stories that used the Conference or the Forum as a news peg to cover some other event or issue were not included in the study. Also, some stories used the Conference as a peg and had a couple of paragraphs directly related to the Conference or Forum, but mostly covered other issues. In such cases, only the relevant paragraphs were coded.

rights, the media, the environment, and the girl child. Analyzing the content of the *Beijing Declaration* was a simple task because its organization enables a quick retrieval of the critical areas of concern. The *NGO Forum on Women: Schedule of Activities* was a printed program of all the sessions that would be held each day of the Forum. A 20% systematic sample of this program, using a random starting point, was content analyzed to create a list of topics of concern to the NGO Forum, not directly covered under the critical areas of concern.⁵

An initial assessment of the newspaper coverage and analysis of the extra media data led to the development of the following variables and respective categories (shown in parentheses) for the coding sheet used in analyzing the U.S. coverage:

1. Critical areas of concern (12 critical areas specified earlier).
2. Additional NGO Forum topics (religion and spirituality; diversity of women's needs; role in development; gay and lesbian issues; cooperation to move forward; research and status reports; arts, poetry, and storytelling).
3. Other topics; that is, topics other than the ones identified under items 1 and 2 (criticism of China, Hillary Clinton's visit and U.S. diplomacy, conflict and disagreement, event and activity description, logistics of platform, media coverage). Three additional categories (praise of China, defense of China, and introduction of participants) were added to the "Other topics" category for the *China Daily* alone.⁶

The coding unit was the paragraph. Paragraphs were multiple coded for all topics (critical areas of concern, NGO Forum topics, and other topics). That is, if more than one topic appeared in a paragraph, each topic was coded.

Intercoder reliability for the U.S. sample was 96.5% for critical areas of concern (i.e., 96.5% of the time both coders found at least one critical area mentioned in the paragraph, or agreed that there were none), 67.5% for other topics, and 97% for NGO topics. For the Chinese sample, intercoder reliability was 79% for the critical areas of concern, 75% for other topics, and 88% for the NGO topics.⁷

⁵First, the fit between each selected item (session topic) and the *Beijing Declaration's* critical areas of concern was checked. Altogether, 401 items fit into the 12 concern areas. Second, the remaining items were analyzed for topics. Third, two researchers independently assigned items to these topics. The few disagreements on assignment of items to topics were resolved through discussion. The researchers were able to categorize most items (159) using this method. Forty-six items were so disparate that they could not be grouped, and 54 items were in a foreign language. An "other" category was needed to capture the stories that did not fit into the established categories.

⁶An attempt was made to include event type (Conference and Forum) as a variable, but media coverage did not make this distinction. Other descriptive data coded were newspaper, date, and page number.

⁷We read sample articles to check for appropriateness of the coding sheet and for clarification of the rules for coding the variables. We also participated in preliminary intercoder reliability check exercises and ironed out coding problems and inconsistencies. The coding sheet went through several iterations before being finalized. An 8% sample was coded to assess intercoder reliability.

TABLE 1
Distribution of Mentions of Other Topics

<i>Other Topics</i>	<i>China Daily</i>		<i>U.S. Papers</i>	
	<i>Frequency</i>	<i>%</i>	<i>Frequency</i>	<i>%</i>
Criticism of China	2	0	719	34
Hillary Clinton's visit/U.S. diplomacy	5	0	297	14
Conflict/disagreement	72	5	229	11
Event/activity description	226	15	264	12
Logistics of platform	130	9	314	15
Media coverage	55	4	38	2
Praise of China	47	3	0	0
Defense of China	60	4	0	0
Participant introduction	386	26	0	0
Other	492	33	277	13
Total	1,475	99 ^a	2,138	100 ^a

Note. Other topics were multiple coded.

^aSome rounding error.

The qualitative assessment of framing was based on careful reading of all stories and identification of the "key words, metaphors, concepts, symbols, and visual images emphasized in the news narratives" (Entman, 1991, p. 7). The study relied primarily on qualitative analysis for the assessment of the frames related to the depiction of women (e.g., the feminism frame and the virtuous woman frame).

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This study sought to examine the extent to which press coverage of the Fourth UN Conference on Women and NGO Forum reflected the agenda and concerns of this important event embodying the global feminist movement. In addition, the study aimed at illuminating the dynamics of framing in news.

Overall, the findings of the study lend support to the hypothesized influence of ideologically driven frames on news coverage. As Table 1 indicates, the bulk of coverage given by the U.S. newspapers to the Conference and the Forum focused not on the critical areas of concern about which the Conference had hoped to raise global consciousness, but on criticism of China; Hillary Clinton's visit; and other descriptions of activity, logistics, conflict, and protest.

The strong influence of anticommunist ideology (i.e., the China frame) on the U.S. news about the Conference, reinforced by journalists' propensity to cover conflict, is clearly reflected in the quantitative prominence given to criticizing China in the news coverage (Table 1). These criticisms constituted 34% of the themes coded

under other topics. Qualitative analysis of the critical discourse against China revealed a clear underlying emphasis on the familiar themes of oppression and deceitfulness that have long been associated with the coverage of China as a communist country.

The majority of the stories depicted China as an oppressive communist nation, characterized by clumsiness and ineptitude. The coverage was replete with dramatic references to China as a nation with a "loathsome human rights record," a nation harboring "dirty secrets" and unwilling to submit to "a rule of law." In that context, China's security measures at the event were repeatedly described as "heavy-handed and oppressive," and its security police referred to as a "grim-faced" and "nervous ... cordon," who "muzzled," "locked out," "hounded," "harassed," "shoved," and generally "held a fist over" the attendees.

The fact that China's restrictive measures dominated the coverage to the extent that they did speaks of the strong ideological salience of this theme to U.S. citizens, politicians, and journalists. Ultimately, the focus on China's violations of human rights became the larger context within which many events were interpreted. Indeed, the China frame superimposed on the Conference was so strong that it tended to obscure the global application of the major theme in Hillary Clinton's speech, "Women's Rights Are Human Rights." In many of the reports, Clinton's references to women's rights as human rights were interpreted as having been specifically directed toward China's human rights record without being specific.

The depiction of China as a clumsy and inept host was reflected in the repeated reference in the stories to such logistical problems as "the muddy mess" (created by rain), the tents that "leaked or collapsed," the "confused cab drivers," and the "heavily overused outdoor toilets," all of which characterized the scene of the proceedings as nothing less than "chaotic" and "comical." In general, the coverage portrayed China as a "big loser," a country that "in its repressiveness and ineptitude was painfully exposed as a not-ready-for-prime-time nation."

The ultimate message contained within the China frame was an assertion of the superiority of the U.S. political and ideological system over that of China. This overarching message was repeatedly articulated in such statements as "China's clumsy efforts to silence the women in Beijing and to wall off its own people from conference activities ... are reflections of a repressive dictatorship that should make any American wary" and "Mrs. Clinton's unapologetic affirmation of American values is a departure from the bland and euphemistic rhetoric of other recent U.S. visitors to Beijing."

The operation of the antifeminist frame, arising from the dominant ideology and reinforced by the journalistic ideology, is reflected, in part, in the quantitative marginalization of the critical areas of concern and the additional NGO Forum topics. Of the total of 2,924 mentions of topics coded in the U.S. coverage, only 733 (25%) mentioned the issues of critical concern to the Conference organizers and attendees (i.e., poverty, education and training, health, violence against women,

TABLE 2
Distribution of Mentions of NGO Topics^a

NGO Topics	China Daily		U.S. Papers	
	Frequency	%	Frequency	%
Religion/spirituality	26	10	1	2
Diversity of women's needs	39	15	7	13
Role in development	64	25	1	2
Gay/lesbian issues	2	1	25	47
Cooperation to move forward	43	17	5	9
Research/status report	32	12	8	15
Arts, poetry, storytelling	48	18	1	2
Other	6	2	5	9
Total	260	100 ^b	53	100 ^b

Note. NGO topics were multiple coded.

^aOther than those subsumed under critical areas of concern. ^bThese do not total 100% due to rounding.

armed conflict, women and economy, power and decision making, institutional mechanisms, human rights, women and media, women and environment, and the girl child). Qualitative analysis, furthermore, revealed that, in many cases, these mentions were just that: mere listings of the topics under discussion, with little effort at in-depth analysis. In particular, the U.S. news stories contained little mention and almost no discussion of the critical areas of concern.

Reflecting the operation of U.S. journalistic ideology, of the total of 2,138 mentions coded as other topics, 229 (11%) described conflict and disagreement and 264 (12%) mentioned an event or activity. The influence of the journalistic ideology is also evident in the quantitative prominence of the paragraphs dealing with U.S. diplomacy and Hillary Clinton (14%) as the primary elite U.S. personality.

The special NGO Forum topics, derived from analyzing the *Schedule of Activities*, received little independent press coverage, and constituted only 53 out of 2,924 (2%) total mentions of topics (see Table 2). Clearly, the atrocities and problems facing women around the world were not treated as major stories for coverage.

Aside from the quantitative marginalization of the central issues, the influence of the antifeminist frame in the U.S. coverage was evident in the often less than complimentary portrayals of the women attending the Conference. The attendees were characterized as "boisterous" and "noisy women," comprising a "divided army." They were "assertive women," "eager for confrontation," who frequently "clashed with tense security forces."

At the qualitative level, the journalistic ideology is reflected not only in the general focus on problems of various kinds (e.g., the logistical problems intertwined with the China frame and the conflict and disagreement intertwined with the feminism frame), but also in the frequent use of such terms as "war of words," "fire-

works," "battle," "clash of civilizations," "deadlock," and "grinding marathon of negotiations" in describing the Conference proceedings. Overall, the coverage reflected a clear journalistic search for events and activities with concrete storytelling elements and was characterized by a tendency toward sensationalization through the use of highly dramatic language.

Ultimately, the operation of the dominant and journalistic ideologies led to a newspaper coverage that was far more concerned with attacking China as a communist country than focusing on the substance of the global issues raised by the Conference.

Clearly, the goals of the global feminist movement and their critical areas of concern held far less immediacy and salience for the U.S. press than the need to assert dominant U.S. values. Operating within the confines of occupational routines and the dominant anticommunist and antifeminist frames, the U.S. newspapers were compelled to cover the Fourth UN Conference on Women and the NGO Forum in Beijing not as an event about women but as an event about China.

On all accounts, China's coverage of the Conference presented a sharp contrast to that provided by the U.S. newspapers. Yet, in so doing, the Chinese coverage further confirmed the hypothesized influence of dominant, elite, and journalistic ideologies on framing.

At the broadest level, the Chinese coverage reflected a proequality frame and a clear focus on the critical issues of concern to the Conference. Of the 3,219 mentions coded, 1,484 (46%) were devoted to the discussion of critical issues. Unlike the U.S. coverage, the Chinese coverage went beyond merely listing the problems and presented extensive discussions of the issues, interlaced with quotes from delegates and participants from around the world. The special NGO Forum topics (i.e., those derived from the *Schedule of Activities*) also received a higher level of attention from the Chinese paper, accounting for 8% of the mentions, compared with 2% in the U.S. coverage (Table 2). Thus, such themes as the role of women in development, current research on the status of women, and cooperative efforts of women around the world received considerably greater attention in *China Daily* coverage.

The emphasis on reaching solutions to critical problems was exemplified in part by the general downplaying of conflict, both quantitatively and qualitatively, in the Chinese coverage. In contrast to the 11% of mentions devoted to conflict by the U.S. media, only 5% of the mentions in the Chinese coverage referred to conflict. (It is important to point out that much of the negative and conflict-oriented coverage by the U.S. media often fell under the more specific category of criticism of China, thus making the conflict category for the U.S. papers smaller than it might otherwise have been.) Also, very often, the coverage given by the U.S. papers to the logistics of the platform had an overtone of conflict, whereas the Chinese coverage emphasized the cooperative efforts of the delegates to reach agreements in the platform.

The strong focus on the theme of cooperation to reach solutions was clearly visible at the qualitative level of analysis. Quotes from the delegates portrayed a gather-

ing of women doing their best “to cooperate so that the Platform of Action will be adopted on the basis of consensus.” The stories pointed out that “there have always been differences in UN Conferences, but these differences are always resolved in the end.” In general, the delegates were portrayed as “working diligently and harmoniously to formulate a practical Platform for Action.” The Secretary General of the Conference, Gertrude Mongella, was repeatedly quoted in the stories, providing highly positive assessments of the proceedings: “The closed door debates [are] going on peacefully and all member states have been cooperative.”

All of these themes combined to present an overall proequality frame, emphasizing the need for cooperative and unified action at the international level to provide solutions to critical areas of concern.

Aside from the clear influence of the dominant communist ideology on such coverage, the effort on the part of the *China Daily* to present an amicable picture of the Conference may be considered to have been driven by China’s elite ideology as Conference host. In addition, the traditional Chinese view of women as being cooperative and peace loving may have reinforced the tendency to depict the negotiations as proceeding peacefully and in a spirit of cooperation.

Despite China’s clear motivation as host to paint itself in a favorable light, *China Daily*’s coverage contained very little propagandistic praise for China. Only 3% of the mentions coded under other topics fit in the category of praise for China (Table 1).

A qualitative examination of the coverage, however, did reveal a constant effort to communicate China’s extensive preparation for the Conference and defend China against the negative Western (particularly U.S.) coverage. Both of these tasks were addressed primarily through straight reporting of China’s preparations for specific events, identifying the logistical problems, giving the reasons behind the problems, and explaining what was being done to alleviate them. The following quotes are typical of such coverage: “The shuttle bus service, which was causing problems two days ago, is now running on track. An official said that an unexpected number of delegates are staying in Beijing,” and “Since the opening of the UN conference, more than 150 shuttle buses have been added to the fleet.”

Aside from such factual reporting, the Chinese paper made use of extensive quotes from the attendees to convey satisfaction with China’s preparations and downplay any logistical problems they may have been experiencing:

- [The Chinese volunteers] are very friendly and helpful.
- The Chinese did not stop working; every time [I] visited the site, everyone was busy working.
- Huairou is a wonderful venue for the NGO Forum.
- The hospitality that we received from the Chinese Government and the people in general has been very very pleasing.

Nevertheless, defense of China against criticism by the Western media did, from time to time, take a slightly heated tone, largely through the use of quotes from the delegates and attendees:

- There were individual cases where security men lacked experience. But those who want to make use of misunderstandings to create conflict should be criticized severely.
- The participants were “surprised and angry” about some Western media ... which only stressed the negative factors and failed to see the “productive things” that came out of the discussion ... this is an insult to all participants at the Forum.
- [The participants] have encountered more serious difficulties than the logistic ones in Huairou. And they know they are here to exchange views on crucial issues concerning women.

Although the coverage reflected a clear effort to respond indirectly to U.S. media criticism, U.S.-related matters were generally absent from the Chinese news reports. The U.S.-induced, last-minute change of venue for Hillary Clinton’s speech, which caused serious logistical problems in accommodating the large numbers of attendees, was one of the most visible instances of coverage given to the United States. In response to the extensive portrayal of this incident by the U.S. media as an example of China’s “restrictive” measures, *China Daily* pointed out simply that the problem was caused by “the U.S. side.”

In general, China’s preparations and defense of China emerged as major frames in the coverage, taking the place of a more direct and propagandistic praise for China. Overall, the policy- and ideology-driven efforts to present China in a positive light, including defending it against criticism, were done in a far more balanced and indirect manner than originally expected.

In further contrast to expectations, there was little evidence of the virtuous woman frame with respect to the virtue of self-sacrifice in the Chinese coverage. What did appear to be emphasized was the cooperative and peaceful nature of women, reflected in their bonding, cooperation, and collective efforts to advance the interests of women all over the world. In addition, the role of women in the achievement of peace (one of the Conference themes) was visibly stressed in the coverage.

A different, potentially more positive, interpretation of the virtuous woman image thus emerged from the Chinese coverage. As such, the Chinese paper’s treatment and portrayal of the women attendees contrasted sharply with the “noisy,” “boisterous,” “aggressive,” and generally incompetent picture of the participants painted by the U.S. media. Whereas the U.S. coverage clearly reflected the radical feminist backlash, the Chinese coverage was generally positive and respectful, treating the Conference as a showcase of womanly virtue in its most positive sense.

Overall, the coverage in both countries clearly reflected the mutually reinforcing operation of the dominant, elite, and journalistic ideologies as primary sources of influence on framing of the news. In the U.S. case, the dominant ideology, reinforced by the journalistic tendency toward sensationalism, led to clear anticommunist and antifeminist frames in the coverage. In the case of China, the dominant communist ideology, amplified by the journalistic ideology's continuing subordination to the Party ideology and emphasis on issues, resulted in a strong proequality frame in covering the major issues of concern to the Conference. The propagandistic influence expected from the Chinese elite ideology was less direct, leading instead to a more subtle framing of China's preparations and defense of China (due perhaps to the recent changes in the government-media relation discussed earlier). Similarly, despite a lack of direct emphasis on the theme of self-sacrifice in the news coverage, certain aspects of the traditional Chinese view of womanly virtue were detectable in the cooperative and peaceful woman frame.

Thus, the findings of this study point to a prominent role played by dominant ideology in the framing of international news. In the context of news work, and in the case of international news coverage in particular, the dominant ideology of the nation (be it capitalist or communist) appears to function as a major source of framing. Although individual journalists can, and sometimes do, succeed in stepping outside such ideological boundaries, their overwhelming tendency to draw on ideologically driven frames serves as a powerful mechanism by which dominant ideology is transmitted and perpetuated through the news media.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Names of the authors are listed in alphabetical order.

REFERENCES

- Barranco, D. A., & Shyles, L. (1988). Arab versus Israeli news coverage in the *New York Times*. *Journalism Quarterly*, 65, 178-181.
- Bauer, J., Feng, W., Riley, N., & Zhao, X. (1992). Gender inequality in urban China. *Modern China*, 18, 333-370.
- Becker, S. (1984). Marxist approaches to media studies: The British experience. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 1, 66-80.
- Breed, W. (1955). Newspaper "opinion leaders" and processes of standardization. *Journalism Quarterly*, 32, 277-284.
- Butler, M., & Paisley, W. (1980). *Women and the mass media*. New York: Human Sciences.
- Chang, T. K. (1988). The news and U.S.-China policy: Symbols in newspapers and documents. *Journalism Quarterly*, 65, 320-327.
- Chang, T. K., Chen, C. H., & Zhang, G. Q. (1993). Rethinking the mass propaganda model: Evidence from the Chinese regional press. *Gazette*, 51, 173-195.

- Chang, T. K., Wang, J., & Chen, C. H. (1994). News as social knowledge in China: The changing worldview of Chinese national media. *Journal of Communication*, 44(3), 52–69.
- Creedon, P. (1993). Framing feminism—A feminist primer for the mass media. *Media Studies Journal*, 7(1–2), 69–80.
- Croll, E. (1983). *Chinese women since Mao*. London: Zen Books.
- Danner, L., & Walsh, S. (1996, August). "Radical" feminists and "bickering" women: Backlash in U.S. media coverage of the United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women. Paper presented at the Convention of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication, Los Angeles.
- Entman, R. M. (1991). Framing U.S. coverage of international news: Contrasts in the narratives of the KAL and Iran Air incidents. *Journal of Communication*, 41(4), 6–27.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51–58.
- Faludi, S. (1991). *Backlash: The undeclared war against American women*. New York: Doubleday.
- Fishman, M. (1977). *Manufacturing the news*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Gan, X. (1994). Debates contribute to the development of the journalistic science. *Journal of Communication*, 44(3), 38–51.
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame analysis*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Hall, S. (1982). The rediscovery of "ideology": Return of the repressed in media studies. In M. Gurevitch, T. Bennett, & J. Woolcott (Eds.), *Culture, society and the media* (pp. 56–90). New York: Methuen.
- Hall, S. (1986). The problem of ideology: Marxism without guarantees. *Journal of Communication Inquiry*, 10(2), 28–44.
- Haque, S. M. (1983). Is U.S. coverage of news in Third World imbalanced? *Journalism Quarterly*, 61, 521–524.
- Huang, W. (1993, July 19–25). Female participation in government. *Beijing Review*, pp. 25–26.
- International Year Book*. (1996). New York: Macmillan.
- Knapp, B. (1992). *Images of Chinese women*. Troy, NY: Whitston.
- Kobland, C. E., Du, L., & Kwan J. (1992). Influence of ideology in news reporting: Case study of *New York Times'* coverage of student demonstrations in China and South Korea. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 2(2), 64–77.
- Li, Y. (1991). *Chinese women through Chinese eyes*. London: East Gate Books.
- Murdock, G., & Golding, P. (1977). Capitalism, communication and class relations. In J. Curran, M. Gurevitch, & J. Woolcott (Eds.), *Mass communication and society* (pp. 12–43). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Norris, P. (1995). The restless search: Network news framing of the post-Cold-War world. *Political Communication*, 12, 357–370.
- Olien, C. N., Tichenor, P. J., & Donohue, G. A. (1989). Media coverage and social movements. In C. T. Salmon (Ed.), *Information campaigns: Balancing social values and social change* (pp. 139–163). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Riffe, D. (1984). International news borrowing: A trend analysis. *Journalism Quarterly*, 61, 142–148.
- Rosen, S. (1995). Women and political change in China. *Pacific Affairs*, 68, 315–341.
- Shoemaker, P., & Reese, S. (1996). *Mediating the message: Theories of influences on media content*. White Plains, NY: Longman.
- The situation of Chinese women*. (1994). Beijing: Information Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China.
- Stempel, G. H., III, & Windhauser, J. W. (1984). The prestige press revisited: Coverage of the 1980 presidential campaign. *Journalism Quarterly*, 61, 49–55.
- Stevenson, R. (1994). *Global communication in the 21st century*. New York: Longman.
- Tempest, R. (1996, February–March). 7:20: Time to turn on the news. *IPI Report*, p. 7.
- Thakur, R. (1997). *Rewriting gender: Reading contemporary Chinese women*. London: Zen Books.

- Tuchman, G. (1978). *Making news: A study in the construction of reality*. New York: Free Press.
- Wang, J., & Chang, T. K. (1996). From class ideologue to state manager: TV programming and foreign imports in China, 1970–1990. *Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Media*, 40, 196–207.
- Wang, M. (1991). Who is dominating whose ideology?: *New York Times* reporting on China. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 2(1), 51–69.
- Wang, Z. (1996). A historic turning point for the women's movement in China. *Signs*, 192–199.
- Weiss, C. (1974). What America's leaders read. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 28, 1–22.
- Yunhu, D. (1995, September 4–10). Differing status of Chinese and American women. *Beijing Review*, pp. 13–16.
- Zhao, J., & MacShane, D. (1994). Mao meets muzac. *New Statesman & Society*, 7(296), 31–34.